



ATRA SPECIAL REPORT

Action without information is dangerous. Information without action is futile.

HOW ARIZONA COMPARES

Arizona's State & Local Tax Burden's About Average

The Census Bureau recently released the FY 2007 tax collection data for all of the states and Arizona's ranking jumps to 22nd based on \$1,000 of personal income and 33rd per capita in total tax collections. As reported in the ATRA *April 2009 Newsletter*, the FY 2006 tax collections initially released for Arizona by the Census Bureau were understated by approximately \$1.8 billion. As a result of the Census Bureau correcting \$1.4 billion of the total amount in question, Arizona's ranking in tax collections has increased significantly relative to other states in FY 2006 and FY 2007.

In the FY 2006 data reported for Arizona, the Census Bureau had completely overlooked \$628 million collected from the education sales tax, \$246 million of the Maricopa County road tax, at least \$480 million in vehicle license tax (VLT), \$60 million in sales taxes collected for the Phoenix Civic Plaza, and approximately \$320 million in local sales tax collections that is still being researched by the Bureau. Although the data is not perfect, the corrections made by the Census Bureau have contributed to greater accuracy and reliability of Arizona's FY 2007 reported tax collections.

As Arizona's tax revenues have continued to decline over the past couple of years, the discussion on "tax reform" has once again resurfaced. It is inevitable that the comparison of national statistics will be utilized when analyzing state and local fiscal systems. However, caution should be exercised with any data that is used as the basis to make policy decisions. Moreover, aggregate per capita of personal income statistics, though popular, have limited value in analyzing effective tax rates as well as the differences in tax burdens between individuals and businesses.

	FY 2006 (w/error)		FY 2006 (corrected)		FY 2007	
	Per Capita	Per \$1,000 of Income	Per Capita	Per \$1,000 of Income	Per Capita	Per \$1,000 of Income
Total Taxes	39 ^{tn}	34 ^{tn}	32 nd	19 ^{tn}	33 ^{ra}	22 ^{na}
General Sales	11"	11""	6 th	5 ¹¹	5 ¹¹	6 ^{tr1}
Property	36 ^{tn}	32 ^{na}	33 ^{ra}	23 ^{ra}	36 th	29 ^{tn}
Individual Income			40 th	40 ^{tri}	40 ^{tri}	40 ^{tri}
Corporate Income			25 th	20 th	26 th	22 ^{na}

Total Tax Collections

An analysis of the data released in the Census Bureau's FY 2007 report shows that, although it appears that Arizona's tax collections continue to be under-reported by as much as \$386 million, the data is clearly more accurate than it has been in past years. As a result, Arizona ranks 33rd per capita in total state and local tax collections out of the 50 states and D.C. Based on per \$1,000 of personal income, which adjusts for the relative wealth between the individual states, Arizona's ranking increases significantly to 22nd.

Arizona's relatively average total state and local tax burden is generated through high sales, average property, and low personal income. Arizona businesses, on the other hand, continue to pay a disproportionately higher

share of property taxes and have maintained an average ranking in the amount they pay in corporate income taxes compared to businesses in other states.

Sales Taxes

Arizona taxpayers continue to pay some of the highest sales taxes in the country. In FY 2007, Arizonan's paid \$1,440.83 per capita in sales taxes, which was significantly higher than the U.S. average of \$1,007.09. The result of paying exorbitantly higher sales taxes than taxpayers in other states ranks Arizona 5th nationally. Similarly, Arizona ranks 6th based on \$1,000 of personal income. The only states that pay higher sales taxes based on per \$1,000 of personal income include Hawaii, Washington, Louisiana, Arkansas, and New Mexico.

Property Taxes

Arizona ranks below average on a per capita and per \$1,000 of personal income basis in total property taxes, at 36th and 29th, respectively. As mentioned earlier, these statistics do not account for the way in which Arizona's property tax system shifts the tax burden from residential to business property. For example, although business property accounts for only 17% of the property tax base, businesses pay 36% of the total property tax burden. Conversely, residential owner-occupied properties account for 65% of the total taxable value in Arizona and pay just 46% of total property taxes.

According to the most recent 50-State Property Tax Comparison Study (2008 Payable) report produced by the Minnesota Taxpayer's Association, shifting the tax burden from homeowners to businesses places Arizona's residential property tax burdens at 40th in the nation. On the other hand, Arizona ranks relatively high compared to other states in business property taxes, ranking 10th nationally, which is a major improvement since Arizona has historically ranked consistently in the top five. The reasons behind Arizona's improved business tax ranking is mainly attributed to the gradual decrease in the assessment ratio for business properties, in addition to the decrease in primary tax rates as a result of a series of methods to control property taxes in the state of Arizona for the last 15 years.

Income Taxes

Of the 44 states that impose individual income taxes, Arizona ranks 40th on a per capita and per \$1,000 of personal income basis. For example, compared to the U.S. average of \$1,156.16 in per capita individual income taxes collected, Arizonan's pay less than 50% of that at \$576.51 per capita. Analyzing the amount collected based on \$1,000 of personal income, Arizona taxpayers pay \$18.79 compared to the U.S. average of \$31.89.

Arizona businesses pay less than the U.S. average in corporate income taxes compared to the 46 other states that levy the tax. The \$151.71 per capita paid by businesses, which is 23% lower than the U.S. average of \$196.12, ranks Arizona 26^{th.} Arizona's rank increases to 22nd when considering the \$4.94 that Arizona businesses pay in corporate income taxes based on \$1,000 of personal income, which is within 10% of the U.S. average.

As long as policymakers continue to use the Census Bureau's aggregate tax collection data to base policy decisions, it is crucial that the data be as accurate as possible. To that end, ATRA intends to recommend that the 2010 Legislature formalize Arizona's reporting process to the Census Bureau.

Jennifer Schuldt

ARIZONA TAX RESEARCH ASSOCIATION Larry Lucero Kevin J. McCarthy...... ...President

Jennifer Schuldt...... ..Office Manager Maria Travers.

Published by the Arizona Tax Research Association a nonprofit organization whose purpose is to promote efficiency and economy in Arizona government and reductions at all levels. Permission to reprint is granted to all publications giving appropriate credit to the Arizona Tax Research Association.

Serving Arizona's taxpayers since 1940.

1814 W. Washington Street Phoenix, Arizona 85007 (602) 253-9121 FAX (602) 253-6719

> www.arizonatax.org atra@arizonatax.org



Total Tax Collections - State & Local FY2007

Per \$1.000

	Per \$1,000					
	Per Capi	ita	of Incom	ne .		
State	Amount	Rank	Amount	Rank		
Alabama	2,886.60	51	95.01	48		
Alaska	7,212.91	2	184.10	1		
Arizona	3,589.85	33	116.98	22		
Arkansas	3,213.55	44	114.94	23		
California	4,704.81	11	119.65	16		
Colorado	3,772.33	28	99.00	47		
Connecticut	6,023.89	5	117.23	21		
D.C.	8,773.07	1	110.24	33		
Delaware	4,190.62	18	153.18	3		
Florida	3,980.91	27	109.14	36		
Georgia	3,422.87	35	110.18	34		
Hawaii	5,096.00	7	138.68	5		
Idaho	3,127.53	46	107.36	39		
Illinois	4,264.77	15	112.19	27		
Indiana	3,310.66	40	104.73	42		
Iowa	3,641.40	31	112.54	26		
Kansas	4,052.08	22	119.23	17		
Kentucky	3,210.31	45	110.46	32		
Louisiana	3,986.19	26	126.07	11		
Maine	4,276.36	14	132.74	7		
Maryland	4,804.17	9	109.78	35		
Massachusetts	4,943.10	8	107.67	38		
Michigan	3,708.21	30	111.51	29		
Minnesota	4,533.18	13	118.18	19		
Mississippi	2,971.35	50	111.31	31		
Missouri	3,246.94	43	101.25	45		
Montana	3,380.36	36	111.41	30		
Nebraska	4,002.20	25	119.21	18		
Nevada	4,016.63	23	108.26	37		
New Hampshire	3,604.41	32	91.02	51		
New Jersey	5,923.54	6	127.08	9		
New Mexico	3,758.76	29	131.17	8		
New York	6,876.10	3	158.33	2		
North Carolina	3,515.62	34	113.58	25		
North Dakota	4,062.37	21	126.95	10		
Ohio	4,009.16	24	121.81	12		
Oklahoma	3,280.68	41	102.26	44		
Oregon	3,363.73	38	103.06	43		
Pennsylvania	4,198.04	17	114.72	24		
Rhode Island	4,555.44	12	119.94	15		
South Carolina	3,081.33	47	106.29	40		
South Dakota	2,976.75	48	94.17	50		
Tennessee	2,973.47	49	94.67	49		
Texas	3,372.32	37	99.85	46		
Utah	3,254.99	42	117.85	20		
Vermont	4,709.55	10	134.12	6		
Virginia	4,167.16	19	105.61	41		
Washington	4,204.02	16	111.95	28		
West Virginia	3,362.03	39	120.91	14		
Wisconsin	4,147.14	20	121.54	13		
Wyoming	6,095.47	4	146.04	4		
U.S. Average	\$ 4,195.07		116.19			

General Sales Tax Collections-State and Local FY2007

Per \$1,000

	Per Capita		of Income	
State	Amount	Rank	Amount	Rank
Alabama	863.29	27	28.41	21
Alaska	261.44	47	6.67	47
Arizona	1,440.83	5	46.95	6
Arkansas	1,326.00	10	47.43	4
California	1,139.94	13	28.99	18
Colorado	1,025.87	18	26.92	23
Connecticut	865.51	26	16.84	42
D.C.	1,416.63	6	24.73	31
Delaware	-	-	-	-
Florida	1,320.11	11	36.19	12
Georgia	1,020.68	19	32.86	14
Hawaii	1,985.44	2	54.03	1
Idaho	840.24	30	28.84	20
Illinois	708.68	40	18.64	41
Indiana	850.51	28	26.90	24
Iowa	772.90	36	23.89	33
Kansas	1,076.37	15	31.67	15
Kentucky	659.98	41	22.71	35
Louisiana	1,595.63	4	50.46	3
Maine	801.25	33	24.87	30
Maryland	612.01	44	13.98	45
Massachusetts	627.20	42	13.66	46
Michigan	798.04	34	24.00	32
Minnesota	870.73	25	22.70	36
Mississippi	1,073.85	16	40.23	9
Missouri	849.34	29	26.49	25
Montana	-	-	-	-
Nebraska	973.27	21	28.99	19
Nevada	1,358.72	8	36.62	11
New Hampshire	-	-	-	-
New Jersey	991.59	20	21.27	39
New Mexico	1,355.28	9	47.30	5
New York	1,128.28	14	25.98	26
North Carolina	771.66	37	24.93	28
North Dakota	889.43	24	27.79	22
Ohio	818.77	32	24.88	29
Oklahoma	934.76	23	29.14	17
Oregon	-	-	-	-
Pennsylvania	712.79	39	19.48	40
Rhode Island	833.30	31	21.94	38
South Carolina	748.55	38	25.82	27
South Dakota	1,205.20	12	38.13	10
Tennessee	1,359.07	7	43.27	7
Texas	1,040.64	17	30.81	16
Utah	935.68	22	33.88	13
Vermont	547.11	46	15.58	43
Virginia	604.38	45	15.32	44
Washington	1,998.18	1	53.21	2
West Virginia	622.51	43	22.39	37
Wisconsin	789.90	35	23.15	34
Wyoming	1,725.46	3	41.34	8
46-State Avg. + D.C.	\$ 1,007.09		\$ 27.86	

Source: Minnesota Taxpayers Association

Source: Minnesota Taxpayers Association

Property Tax Collections - State an	d Local
FY2007	
	Per \$1.000
Dan Canita	-f l

	Per Capita		of Income	
State	Amount	Rank	Amount	Rank
Alabama	449.50	51	14.79	51
Alaska	1,510.76	12	38.56	16
Arizona	957.08	36	31.19	29
Arkansas	472.22	50	16.89	49
California	1,135.04	27	28.87	35
Colorado	1,145.94	25	30.07	32
Connecticut	2,303.75	3	44.83	8
D.C.	2,561.61	1	17.14	48
Delaware	651.67	44	44.73	9
Florida	1,464.06	14	40.14	14
Georgia	982.85	33	31.64	28
Hawaii	882.43	38	24.01	42
Idaho	731.56	42	25.11	41
Illinois	1,581.89	10	41.61	13
Indiana	963.95	34	30.49	31
lowa	1,204.25	21	37.22	18
Kansas	1,234.32	20	36.32	20
Kentucky	604.34	46	20.79	45
Louisiana	591.32	47	18.70	46
Maine	1,562.70	11	48.51	6
Maryland	1,162.17	24	26.56	39
Massachusetts	1,699.29	9	37.01	19
Michigan	1,453.24	15	43.70	11
Minnesota	1,172.17	22	30.56	30
Mississippi	750.83	40	28.13	36
Missouri	889.40	37	27.73	37
Montana	1,143.55	26	37.69	17
Nebraska	1,336.84	17	39.82	15
Nevada	1,105.68	29	29.80	34
New Hampshire	2,212.86	5	55.88	2
New Jersey	2,474.56	2	53.09	4
New Mexico	508.62	49	17.75	47
New York	1,953.64	7	44.98	7
North Carolina	792.25	39	25.59	40
North Dakota	1,090.03	30	34.06	22
Ohio	1,163.01	23	35.33	21
Oklahoma	530.14	48	16.52	50
Oregon	1,044.29	31	32.00	27
Pennsylvania	1,242.25	19	33.95	23
Rhode Island	1,868.71	8	49.20	5
South Carolina	958.67	35	33.07	24
South Dakota	1,019.87	32	32.26	26
Tennessee	720.73	43	22.95	43
Texas	1,405.67	16	41.62	12
Utah	744.91	41	26.97	38
Vermont	1,981.32	6	56.42	1
Virginia	1,289.49	18	32.68	25
Washington	1,125.73	28	29.98	33
West Virginia	626.20	45	22.52	44
Wisconsin	1,493.82	13	43.78	10
Wyoming	2,247.21	4	53.84	3
U.S. Average	\$ 1,260.09		\$ 34.92	

Source: Minnesota Taxpayers Association

Individual Tax Collections - State and Local FY2007

Per \$1,000

Per \$1,000				
	Per Capi		of Incom	
State	Amount	Rank	Amount	Rank
Alabama	655.16	38	21.56	36
Alaska	-	-	-	-
Arizona	576.51	40	18.79	40
Arkansas	759.42	32	27.16	28
California	1,450.57	7	36.89	7
Colorado	970.84	20	25.48	32
Connecticut	1,809.38	4	35.21	10
D.C.	1,229.26	11	32.34	16
Delaware	2,218.68	1	38.74	4
Florida	-	-	-	-
Georgia	908.49	27	29.24	19
Hawaii	1,211.23	12	32.96	14
Idaho	922.99	25	31.69	18
Illinois	729.25	34	19.18	39
Indiana	818.44	30	25.89	31
Iowa	913.05	26	28.22	24
Kansas	980.18	19	28.84	22
Kentucky	946.67	21	32.57	15
Louisiana	728.70	35	23.05	35
Maine	1,031.79	18	32.03	17
Maryland	1,907.03	3	43.58	3
Massachusetts	1,754.34	5	38.21	5
Michigan	690.88	37	20.78	37
Minnesota	1,385.12	8	36.11	9
Mississippi	477.03	42	17.87	41
Missouri	874.26	28	27.26	26
Montana	860.95	29	28.37	23
Nebraska	925.68	24	27.57	25
Nevada	_	_	-	-
New Hampshire	81.66	43	2.06	43
New Jersey	1,350.64	9	28.97	21
New Mexico	593.60	39	20.72	38
New York	2,188.96	2	50.40	1
North Carolina	1,148.18	14	37.09	6
North Dakota	494.00	41	15.44	42
Ohio	1,196.41	13	36.35	8
Oklahoma	761.83	31	23.75	34
Oregon	1,480.68	6	45.37	2
Pennsylvania	1,068.76	16	29.21	20
Rhode Island	1,033.13	17	27.20	27
South Carolina	723.13	36	24.94	33
South Dakota	-	-	-	_
Tennessee	40.77	44	1.30	44
Texas	-		- 1.50	-
Utah	935.89	22	33.88	11
Vermont	935.49	23	26.64	30
Virginia	1,317.90	10	33.40	12
Washington	1,317.90	-	- 33.40	14
West Virginia	749.81	33	26.97	29
Wisconsin	1,125.39	33 15	32.98	13
Wyoming	1, 123.39	-	JZ.30 -	_'3
iv young		-	_	_
44-State Average	\$ 1,156.16		\$ 31.89	
	, .,		, 000	

Corporate Income Tax Collections - State and Local FY2007

Per \$1,000

	Per Capita		of Income		
State	Amount	Rank	Amount	Rank	
Alabama	108.51	37	3.57	34	
Alaska	1,185.74	1	30.26	1	
Arizona	151.71	26	4.94	22	
Arkansas	127.12	32	4.55	28	
California	303.56	6	7.72	7	
Colorado	97.06	42	2.55	43	
Connecticut	235.61	9	4.58	27	
D.C.	346.15	3	9.11	4	
Delaware	-	-	-	-	
Florida	133.26	31	3.65	33	
Georgia	105.02	40	3.38	36	
Hawaii	78.29	44	2.13	45	
Idaho	123.52	34	4.24	31	
Illinois	227.60	12	5.99	13	
Indiana	154.80	24	4.90	23	
lowa	108.27	38	3.35	37	
Kansas	188.22	15	5.54	16	
Kentucky	231.44	11	7.96	6	
Louisiana	170.67	20	5.40	18	
Maine	139.66	28	4.34	30	
Maryland	138.82	29	3.17	39	
Massachusetts	324.24	5	7.06	9	
Michigan	178.56	19	5.37	19	
Minnesota	226.77	13	5.91	14	
Mississippi	125.64	33	4.71	26	
Missouri	66.08	46	2.06	46	
Montana	184.72	16	6.09	12	
Nebraska	119.45	35	3.56	35	
Nevada	-	-	-	-	
New Hampshire	452.79	2	11.43	2	
New Jersey	332.52	4	7.13	8	
New Mexico	231.75	10	8.09	5	
New York	277.89	8	6.40	11	
North Carolina	169.75	22	5.48	17	
North Dakota	212.67	14	6.65	10	
Ohio	98.00	41	2.98	41	
Oklahoma	154.12	25	4.80	25	
Oregon	107.08	39	3.28	38	
Pennsylvania	183.68	17	5.02	21	
Rhode Island	170.51	21	4.49	29	
South Carolina	69.62	45	2.40	44	
South Dakota	95.33	43	3.02	40	
Tennessee	180.28	18	5.74	15	
Texas	-	-	-	-	
Utah	145.77	27	5.28	20	
Vermont	134.18	30	3.82	32	
Virginia	113.21	36	2.87	42	
Washington	-	-	-	-	
West Virginia	297.13	7	10.69	3	
Wisconsin	164.07	23	4.81	24	
Wyoming	-	-	-	-	
46-State Average	\$ 196.12		\$ 5.42		

Source: Minnesota Taxpayers Association

Source: Minnesota Taxpayers Association

Residential Property Taxes Payable 2008

Industrial Property Taxes Payable 2008

\$150,000 Land and Building

\$25,000,000 Land and Building \$12,500,000 Machinery and Equipment \$10,000,000 Inventories \$2,500,000 Fixtures

Rank 1	<u>State</u> Michigan	NET TAX 4,831	ETR 3.220%	<u>Rank</u> 1	State South Carolina	NET TAX 1,864,900	ETR 3.896%
2	Connecticut	4,012	2.675%	2	Michigan	1,724,404	3.317%
3	Illinois	3,636	2.424%	3	Texas	1,470,297	2.524%
4	New York	3,435	2.290%	4	Mississippi	1,291,050	2.485%
5	Pennsylvania	3,414	2.276%	5	Kansas	1,264,650	2.339%
6	Wisconsin	3,110	2.073%	6	Missouri	1,264,358	2.232%
7	Maryland	3,065	2.043%	7	Indiana	1,121,475	2.209%
8	Nebraska	2,953	1.968%	8	lowa	1,111,255	2.209%
9	North Dakota	2,955	1.900 %	9	Tennessee	1,069,372	2.190%
10	Texas	2,817	1.878%	10	Arizona	1,033,544	1.994%
11 12	Iowa	2,659 2,551	1.772% 1.700%	11 12	New York Connecticut	988,045	1.987% 1.962%
	Tennessee					949,440	
13	New Jersey	2,510	1.673%	13	D.C.	911,994	1.807%
	Vermont	2,444	1.630%	14	Pennsylvania	903,738	1.787%
15	New Hampshire	2,438	1.626%	15	Louisiana	833,234	1.781%
16	Maine	2,212	1.474%	16	West Virginia	806,641	1.688%
17	Ohio	2,154	1.436%	17	Nebraska	783,407	1.589%
18	Missouri	2,127	1.418%	18	Minnesota	778,796	1.544%
19	Mississippi	2,067	1.378%	19	Colorado	768,831	1.527%
20	Georgia	1,946	1.297%	20	Georgia	760,381	1.475%
21	Alaska	1,918	1.278%	21	Illinois	756,664	1.459%
22	Kansas	1,915	1.277%	22	Arkansas	686,550	1.396%
23	Indiana	1,843	1.229%	23	Rhode Island	683,224	1.381%
24	North Carolina	1,825	1.216%	24	Vermont	677,683	1.346%
25	New Mexico	1,768	1.179%	25	Maine	669,324	1.339%
	Arkansas	1,762	1.175%	26	Oklahoma	644,880	1.313%
27	Oregon	1,742	1.161%	27	Ohio	641,250	1.292%
28	Rhode Island	1,740	1.160%	28	Massachusetts	608,593	1.231%
29	South Dakota	1,721	1.148%	29	Florida	594,814	1.211%
30	California	1,701	1.134%	30	New Mexico	593,950	1.188%
31	Nevada	1,698	1.132%	31	Oregon	583,896	1.184%
32	Kentucky	1,682	1.121%	32	Wisconsin	578,314	1.172%
33	Oklahoma	1,649	1.099%	33	Alaska	568,441	1.155%
34	Minnesota	1,647	1.098%	34	Maryland	553,776	1.150%
35	Florida	1,614	1.076%	35	Alabama	552,640	1.108%
36	Delaware	1,213	0.809%	36	North Dakota	491,071	1.064%
37	West Virginia	1,161	0.774%	37	North Carolina	480,943	0.997%
38	Montana	1,129	0.752%	38	Montana	471,952	0.972%
39	Washington	1,087	0.725%	39	California	469,875	0.952%
40	Arizona	1,075	0.716%	40	Utah	457,588	0.915%
	Wyoming	1,057	0.705%	41	Nevada	439,983	0.911%
	Louisiana	993	0.662%	42	ldaho	404,400	0.853%
43	Alabama	983	0.655%		New Jersey	401,625	0.837%
	Utah	920	0.613%		New Hampshire	348,036	0.813%
	South Carolina	895	0.597%		South Dakota	333,741	0.761%
	Virginia	842	0.561%		Wyoming	327,100	0.689%
	Colorado	799	0.533%		Kentucky	254,363	0.680%
	Idaho	714	0.476%		Washington	241,498	0.622%
	D.C.	693	0.462%		Hawaii	238,840	0.546%
	Hawaii	229	0.153%		Virginia	231,241	0.462%
51	Massachusetts	148	0.099%		Delaware	202,238	0.404%
01	AVERAGE	1,877	1.251%	31	AVERAGE	725,151	1.450%