K-12 Desegregation/Office of Civil Rights (OCR) Funding

• A Brief History
• Finance scheme
• Inequity challenges

Sean McCarthy
The taxpayer’s watchdog for over 70 years

Arizona Tax Research Association

Intro

• $4.1 billion levied for Deseg/OCR since 1986
  – 19 School Districts
  – More than half to Phoenix Union & Tucson Unified
• $211 mil levied annually via primary prop taxes
• Not equalized by state; outside RCL
• Capped in 2009, not tied to pupils or inflation
• Not voter approved; no planned phase out

Desegregation is the most problematic inequity issue for K-12 finance
A Brief History

• Legislature passed SB 1077 (Laws 1985, Chapter 166), creating an exemption from the revenue control limit (RCL) for “expenses of complying with a court order of desegregation or administrative agreement” etc. Later changes resulted in the authority to exceed the capital outlay revenue limit.

• A.R.S. §15-910 (G-J), school districts may levy property taxes in excess of the state’s limits without voter approval if the district has either a court order of desegregation or an administrative agreement with OCR. This exemption from the limits may continue even after the court order is lifted or the OCR agreement expires. The levy amount was hard capped in 2009.

“...directed toward remediating alleged or proven racial discrimination”
• 19 school districts levy outside their budget limits for Deseg/OCR

• Only 2 districts ever had a court order to desegregate:
  – Tucson Unified School District (TUSD)
  – Phoenix Union High School District (PUHSD)

• Dozens of districts have had agreements with OCR- not just the ones who use the levy authority
History (cont)

• A 1990 special study by the Auditor General found
  
  “...some expenditures are clearly not related to desegregation orders and agreements.”

• Total Deseg/OCR levy in ’90 for 10 districts: $43 million
• 33 districts had an order or OCR agreement
• Recommended stronger accountability, separate reporting, and budget supplanting rules
  
  “Arizona can expect continued growth in the amount of desegregation expenditures.”
“If it means [use] desegregation funding to assist in our budgetary process, then that’s what we need to do”

Yolanda Strayhand, Washington Elementary Board member

As quoted in The Arizona Republic following an override election failure, 2000
Arizona Tax Research Association

Desegregation Tax Levies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School District</th>
<th>FY 2015 Deseg Totals</th>
<th>TY 2014 Primary Rate</th>
<th>Deseg as rate</th>
<th>FY 2015 RCL</th>
<th>Deseg levy as % of RCL</th>
<th>ADM</th>
<th>Deseg$ */ADM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tucson Unified</td>
<td>$63,711,047</td>
<td>$6.8021</td>
<td>$2.1225</td>
<td>$239,967,994</td>
<td>26.5%</td>
<td>46,086</td>
<td>$1,382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phoenix Union</td>
<td>$55,800,892</td>
<td>$3.4171</td>
<td>$1.3496</td>
<td>$141,275,843</td>
<td>39.5%</td>
<td>27,060</td>
<td>$2,062</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tempe Elementary</td>
<td>$14,178,248</td>
<td>$3.3038</td>
<td>$1.1563</td>
<td>$52,607,708</td>
<td>27.0%</td>
<td>11,226</td>
<td>$1,263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roosevelt Elementary</td>
<td>$13,570,494</td>
<td>$4.3869</td>
<td>$2.7257</td>
<td>$44,249,659</td>
<td>30.7%</td>
<td>9,551</td>
<td>$1,421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phoenix Elementary</td>
<td>$11,151,530</td>
<td>$4.4773</td>
<td>$1.8667</td>
<td>$32,558,707</td>
<td>34.3%</td>
<td>6,744</td>
<td>$1,654</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mesa Unified</td>
<td>$8,774,057</td>
<td>$4.9302</td>
<td>$0.3497</td>
<td>$312,208,054</td>
<td>2.8%</td>
<td>60,210</td>
<td>$146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scottsdale Unified</td>
<td>$7,382,169</td>
<td>$3.1091</td>
<td>$0.1694</td>
<td>$123,083,899</td>
<td>0.6%</td>
<td>23,312</td>
<td>$317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Washington Elementary</td>
<td>$6,350,000</td>
<td>$2.9215</td>
<td>$0.5886</td>
<td>$105,669,590</td>
<td>6.0%</td>
<td>18,331</td>
<td>$346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cartwright Elementary</td>
<td>$4,628,061</td>
<td>$4.3281</td>
<td>$2.3292</td>
<td>$80,454,593</td>
<td>5.8%</td>
<td>17,738</td>
<td>$261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glendale Union</td>
<td>$6,131,959</td>
<td>$2.5904</td>
<td>$0.4649</td>
<td>$76,091,974</td>
<td>8.1%</td>
<td>14,961</td>
<td>$410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Isaac Elementary</td>
<td>$4,951,155</td>
<td>$2.6025</td>
<td>$4.2686</td>
<td>$31,179,458</td>
<td>15.9%</td>
<td>6,637</td>
<td>$746</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amphitheater Unified</td>
<td>$4,025,000</td>
<td>$4.3876</td>
<td>$0.2924</td>
<td>$68,823,015</td>
<td>5.8%</td>
<td>13,759</td>
<td>$293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holbrook Unified</td>
<td>$2,517,481</td>
<td>$3.7778</td>
<td>$5.4503</td>
<td>$12,302,062</td>
<td>20.5%</td>
<td>2,037</td>
<td>$1,236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flagstaff Unified</td>
<td>$2,241,322</td>
<td>$3.8502</td>
<td>$0.2171</td>
<td>$49,553,965</td>
<td>4.5%</td>
<td>9,268</td>
<td>$242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilson Elementary</td>
<td>$1,946,054</td>
<td>$4.4554</td>
<td>$2.4673</td>
<td>$54,655,351</td>
<td>35.6%</td>
<td>1,164</td>
<td>$1,672</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Window Rock Unified**</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>$0.0000</td>
<td>$0.0000</td>
<td>$12,513,895</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>2,056</td>
<td>$0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agua Fria Union</td>
<td>$999,000</td>
<td>$2.9900</td>
<td>$0.1079</td>
<td>$36,109,498</td>
<td>2.8%</td>
<td>7,605</td>
<td>$131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buckeye Elementary</td>
<td>$1,701,402</td>
<td>$3.7761</td>
<td>$1.0608</td>
<td>$21,034,328</td>
<td>8.1%</td>
<td>4,697</td>
<td>$362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maricopa Unified</td>
<td>$1,291,000</td>
<td>$5.1646</td>
<td>$0.5596</td>
<td>$30,183,623</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
<td>2,725</td>
<td>$474</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>$211,350,871</td>
<td>$3.7511</td>
<td>$1.4498</td>
<td>$77,649,117</td>
<td>14.9%</td>
<td>15,009</td>
<td>$759</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Statewide total $211m in FY15

*FY14 M&O Equalization Formula only provided $5,376 per pupil, JLBC
Examples of Inequity

Murphy El. District
- M&O Per Pupil: $8,631
- Stud/Teacher ratio: 21:1
- Pri rate for education: $1.43

Phoenix El. District
- Per Pupil Spending: $9,494
- Stud/Teacher ratio: 14:1
- Pri rate for education: $3.95

The taxpayer’s watchdog for over 70 years
Examples of Inequity

Tolleson Union District

Per Pupil Spending: $5,990
Avg Teacher Pay: $42k
Stud/Teacher ratio: 18:1

Per 2013 Auditor General report & ADE Supt Report

The taxpayer’s watchdog for over 70 years

Phoenix Union District

Per Pupil Spending: $9,578
Avg Teacher Pay: $57k
Stud/Teacher ratio: 18:1
Deseg money: $55.8m
Inequality in Elementary Districts

**Isaac Elementary** (west Phoenix) $6 million in Deseg
• Spends 11% more per pupil than peer districts

**Wilson Elementary** (southeast Phoenix) $2m in Deseg
• Spends 44% more per pupil than peer districts

**Surrounded by districts without Deseg**
– Alhambra Elementary (Northwest Phoenix, Glendale)
– Osborn Elementary (Central Phoenix)
– Glendale Elementary
– Murphy Elementary (West-downtown Phx)
– Riverside Elementary (Estrella Village)
– Balsz Elementary (East Phoenix)
– Creighton Elementary (East Phoenix)

Per 2013 Auditor General report
Inequality for Large Unified’s

• Scottsdale USD: $7,570 per pupil ($7.3 million Deseg)
  – Deer Valley USD: $6,597
  – Cave Creek USD: $6,900
  – Peoria USD: $6,708
  – Dysart USD: $6,862

• Mesa USD: $7,706 per pupil ($8 million Deseg)
  – Chandler USD: $6,644
  – Gilbert USD: $6,791
  – Apache Junction USD: $7,081

• Tucson Unified: $8,421 per pupil ($63 million Deseg)

Per 2013 Auditor General report
Phoenix Union vs Large Union Districts

- Phoenix Union: $9,578 per pupil ($58m Deseg)
- Glendale Union: $7,879 ($6.1m Deseg)
- Tempe Union: $7,239
- Tolleson Union: $5,990
- Yuma Union: $6,625

Phoenix Union no longer under court order; declared unitary

Per 2013 Auditor General report
Tucson Unified

- 1978: found in violation by federal district court of discrimination based on race and national origin
  – *Fisher, Mendoza, U.S. v. TUSD*
- 2008: District petition for unitary status approved
- 2009: Post-Unitary Status Plan approved by lower court, officially unitary
- 2011: unitary status revoked “failed to monitor, evaluate, and report” by 9th circuit
- 2013: Unitary Status Plan (USP) approved by court
- District plans to re-apply for unitary status 2016-17

*The taxpayer’s watchdog for over 70 years*
STUDENTS ELIGIBLE FOR FREE OR REDUCED LUNCH IN Maricopa County elementary school districts

% Eligible
- 60%+
- 80%+
- 90%+

= OCR Money

Phx Union
(Deseg)

Glendale
Union
(OCR)

★ Taxpayers pay twice for Deseg/OCR

2011 data from AZ Department of Education. Cronkite News Service Interactive map by Nicole Gilbert.